

MINUTE EXHIBIT A
Port Commission Regular
Meeting of February 25, 2020

Jordan Van Voast
2109 31st Ave. S.
Seattle, WA 98144

February 24, 2020

Honorable Fred Felleman
Honorable Stephanie Bowman
Honorable Peter Steinbrueck
Honorable Ryan Calkins
Honorable Sam Cho

Dear Port of Seattle Commissioners,

I acknowledge your sincere efforts to represent the best interests of the citizens of Seattle, the surrounding communities and the planet. The T46 cruise expansion project conflicts with these interests though, as it is flawed on scientific, moral, and even economic grounds. All these issues are interrelated. Please consider:

Climate: Seattle's cruise ship industry in 2019 was responsible for approximately 1.6 million tons of greenhouse gases (GHG) when one includes flight emissions associated with cruise travel. Cruise ships run on fossil fuels. While it is possible that truly sustainable fuels may be developed in the future, that won't happen soon enough to support a rapidly expanding cruise industry while still meeting international and the Port's own climate targets of reducing GHG emissions by 50% by 2030. The Port's efforts to green its operations by implementing and requiring dockside plug in, battery powered vehicles, solar panels, clean fuels, kelp bed sequestration pilot projects, etc. are all commendable. But none of these GHG mitigation efforts, individually or collectively, will happen fast enough to reduce the explosive growth of cruise emissions. The emissions from ships are just too large. From a climate lens, we should be working to shrink cruise travel, not expand it.

Liquid Natural Gas. (LNG). Carnival Corporation representatives bragged during the 2019 Connections Convention in Seattle about how they are converting ships to be cleaner by running on LNG. We now know that emissions from LNG fuels may actually be worse than heavy fuel oil (HFO).

The International Maritime Organization (IMO) last fall also stated that LNG is not a viable fuel.

Conclusions of the IMO report on LNG: " LNG has substantial methane emissions throughout the supply chain (well-to-wake), which means that even with the use of high-pressure engines, with lower methane slip, the overall life cycle analysis would show little or no carbon savings and, in many cases, worse performance compared to HFO/MGO. Instead of engaging in a complicated and ultimately unproductive shift from one fossil fuel to another, activities under the IMO GHG Strategy should focus on delivering short-term emission reductions in the existing fleet and speeding up the development of genuine low carbon fuels and the roll out of zero emission vessels. "

Public Health. As Dr. Annemarie Dooley and Dr. Chris Covert-Bowlds from Washington Physicians for Social Responsibility on 2/11/20, the public health impacts of cruise ships are not factored into economic models in our current dominant economic system of capitalism. Asthma, early death, lung cancer, etc. are a side effect of cruise ship exhaust. The sulfur and nitrous oxide soot emitted from smokestacks can travel 100 miles. One ship can emit more soot than . Even with dockside plug in, the ships still must turn on their engines when entering and leaving port. These harmful impacts to air quality will not be eliminated by electrifying the waterfront. Indirect public health impacts of cruise ships include the smoke from increased wildfires due to climate change. Other climate change health related disasters include flooding, hurricanes, and sea level rise. These impacts are global and are disproportionately felt in front line communities in the global south.

Man Camps & the MMIW Crisis. Another public health cost of fossil fuel related development is the connection to the epidemic of missing and murdered indigenous women (MMIW). When pipelines and fracking wells are being constructed, the large, transient, mostly male workforces are set up in what are known as "man camps". Statistics have shown that spikes in the incidence of missing and murdered indigenous women follow the construction routes. In fact, there is even one path in Canada referred to as "The Highway of Tears". These man camps also disrupt indigenous communities by bringing with them an increase of domestic violence, drug abuse, human trafficking, and homelessness via inflated rent markets, to the small towns nearby, which are often indigenous communities, unequipped to handle this influx of workers with no ties to the community, no family nearby, large paychecks, and emotionally and physically difficult job stresses. (

Further impacts include poisoning of the water table due to radioactive fracking chemicals injected into shale beds, pipeline ruptures and leaks, "bomb" trains like the one that killed 47 people in Lac Megantic, Quebec in

2013 and land theft and violence against indigenous communities defending their traditional territories.

Land Theft, Destruction, Violence. First Nations inhabitants in British Columbia are still being removed from their rightful lands for gas corporations, in some instances, such as the ongoing case surrounding unceded Wet'suwet'en territory, at gunpoint by RCMP's who have been authorized to use lethal force even though the Wet'suwet'en are unarmed. The land in question has been cared for in a way that they can still drink clean water from the river, subsist on hunting and trapping game and gathering, and is home to an established treatment center for people to heal from colonial violence and addiction, and has many sites of cultural significance. What do you suppose this territory will look like after the gas company is finished with it? How clean will the water remain? How much game and habitat will be lost to pollution, roads and infrastructure? How many burial sites will be desecrated?

To the extent that the decisions of the Port seek to expand fossil fuel intensive industries, we are complicit in all these harms - to the climate, public health, and native communities. The Canada Gas Link project at the center of the Wet'suwet'en - BC government conflict would pump gas to an LNG facility in Kitimat, on the BC coast. Any decision of the Port of Seattle which factors in LNG as a "bridge fuel" for cruise ships to address the climate crisis is flawed, not only by the science (mentioned above), but via these injustices. The Tacoma LNG project also could be used as a cruise ship fueling source for LNG powered cruise ships. LNG infrastructure and shipping is acknowledged by terrorism experts as a high risk target due to its highly explosive nature. Deadly explosions can also have accidental causes.

Sacrifice Zones and Turning a Blind Eye. The Puyallup Tribe has not been meaningfully consulted by a single agency involved in the entire permit process of the proposed Tacoma LNG refinery, storage tank and bunkering facility being constructed on Medicine Creek Treaty Territory, on the border of the Puyallup Reservation. Fracked gas refineries like this one emit toxins and carcinogens 24 hours a day, including xylene, toluene and benzene, which can cause cancer, asthma, birth defects, neurological disorders and other serious health impacts. Fossil fuel refineries are disproportionately located on or next to indigenous communities and reservations. The Port of Tacoma, on MCT Territory, is a prime example; US Oil, Targa, & Westrock, with expansion papers filed and Puget Sound Energy's LNG on deck to occupy part of the Occidental Superfund site, one of many Superfund sites nearby. No cumulative air testing is measured for toxins, no public health assessments are ordered before projects & expansions are rubber stamped, nobody stops construction

that began long before obtaining the necessary permits. Salmon runs are all but gone from what was once a thriving and abundant estuary filled with nourishment and drinkable water. Puyallup are Salmon People and have cared for these lands, waters and creatures since time immemorial, with this stewardship inseparable from cultural and spiritual practices. To the extent that the Port of Seattle makes decisions which taps into toxic energy infrastructure, it is complicit in the many harms of these facilities.

- 12/19

Oil and Water don't mix – Industrial Accidents. Science and history are clear - fossil fuel intensive industries like cruise ships - are a factor in the death and destruction of the biosphere and all life. Accelerating the climate emergency is just one unacceptable outcome of the T46 project. Oil spills are another. Sources indicate that the oil fueling Seattle's cruise ships originates from undersea oil reservoirs on the North Slope of Alaska. From there it is pumped via pipeline to Valdez and then shipped via tanker along the same route that the Exxon Valdez took in 1989 when it dumped 11 million gallons into Prince William Sound. Arriving in Tacoma, the oil is refined and barged back to Seattle and then pumped onto cruise ships. Some of the oil may come from the Canadian tar sands, an environmental disaster of epic proportions. At each stage of this process, there are risks of an oil spill affecting the ocean, rivers, lakes, and living beings. Pipeline ruptures are commonplace. The Trans Mountain Pipeline will bring a 700% increase in tanker traffic to the same treacherous channels that cruise ships travel. It's only a matter of time before a ship loses power in a storm, or there is a collision in the fog, or a barge gets away from a tug. Heavy fuel oil can't be cleaned up. More than 30 years later, there are still beaches in Prince William Sound oozing with oil. The herring, guillemot and some species of orca have never recovered.

Overtourism. "When cities invest in the visitor market (hotels, convention centers, festivals) they are ordinarily playing a final, desperate card in economic development."

It is tragically

ironic that the proposed location of the T46 terminal is

", where Duwamish canoes used to pull ashore at their village near today's Pioneer Square. And while many of the residents in today's Pioneer Square may have not little idea of what is in store for their neighborhood when 6000 or more passengers embark and disembark from the largest cruise ships in the world, people in small towns between here and Alaska have lived in the shadow of the ever-expanding cruise market for decades. Village life has morphed into overcrowded shopping malls for wealthy people during the cruise season, shops filled with items made far away which

produce little benefit for local economies. Many of these
" shops are not even locally owned.

Orcas and Marine Life. Sometime in late 2019, the orca named Mega (L-41) passed away, reducing the population of the critically endangered Southern Resident Killer Whales (SRKW) to 71 individuals – their lowest level ever. With orca calves rarely surviving due to likely toxic side effects of pollution and malnutrition, the outlook for the Northwest's foremost iconic species is dire. As detailed in my February 11 letter to the Port, while the dams on the Columbia and Snake River are the principal cause of the orca's decline, ship noise, toxic pollution from scrubbers which acidify and pollute the ocean, and climate heating in general, also play a role. Ship engine and propeller noises interfere with orca echolocation used in hunting salmon. Increases in ocean acidity harmful to ocean life is caused both by the increased atmospheric carbon, and the scrubbers. This is causing a collapse of shellfish population. Warmer summers and more frequent droughts causing lower stream volumes and increased reservoir temperatures also impacts juvenile salmon survival, which in turn affects the orcas. Again, the harmful feedback loops of the T46 project are many.

Economics and Morality. While arguments regarding hypothetical (and many would say inflated) tourist dollars pumped into the local economy are often pointed to as justifications for the T46 project, these numbers rarely if ever include any accounting of future economic losses due to climate change. These future losses are likely to dwarf any financial profit from the Port's cruise business, even if we rapidly work to decarbonize our economy and culture. Financial losses due to climate change related drought in Washington state in 2015 reached approximately \$1.5 billion alone. Nor do these Chamber of Commerce themed analyses factor in economic related health impacts in mortality and morbidity from air pollution, moral and legal shortcomings related to the treaty infringements and violence involved in fossil fuel sourcing (discussed above at length), quality of life issues for small port inhabitants who have no elected representation on this Commission, or worker equity issues relating to the exploited low wage workforce underpinning the cruise industry.

"Jobs, Jobs, Jobs." Similarly, arguments are advanced that maritime jobs will be lost to other Ports without the T46 project. Firstly, as public elected officials, it is your duty to think long term regarding the best means to achieve a sustainable economy, with good paying jobs that do not foreclose the future of life on the planet. As with national and local Green New Deal plans, we need to ensure a just transition for workers away from jobs which accelerate the

climate emergency, harm the environment and living beings. These opportunities are widely being discussed now and I urge you to explore them and think boldly while we still have time to prevent runaway climate warming. Regarding the decisions of other Ports, there are many financial uncertainties and challenges currently facing the cruise industry. Other Ports will make their own decisions, hopefully after conducting deep and broad listening with their citizens. Your job and opportunity though, is to be leaders in bringing the Port into balance with the important issues outlined above which are of utmost consequence for all life, present and future.

I urge you to exercise smart leadership. Work with your constituencies to help affected workers secure sustainable and beneficial employment. Use your platform to become climate justice leaders. We are running out of time, not just for our children, but for all life on Earth. Please cancel the T46 project.

Thank you for listening

Jordan Van Voast, L.Ac.
Co-President, Dharma Friendship Foundation

Appendix: